

CITY OF MESA
MINUTES OF THE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMITTEE

DATE: March 13, 2003 **TIME:** 6:00 p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT

Chair Victor Linoff
David Dean
Pat Mendivil
Ron Peters
Tracy Wright Wagner

STAFF PRESENT

Greg Marek
Tony Felice
Katrina Bradshaw
Kathy Guthmiller
Sandra Apsey
Angelica Docog
Jerry Howard

OTHERS PRESENT

Patricia Cosand
William Magers
Jennifer Malhi
Joe Nucci

MEMBERS ABSENT

Lori Osiecki
Vince Anderson

1. Call to Order

The March 13, 2003 Regular Meeting of the Historic Preservation Committee was called to order at 6:15 p.m. Chair Linoff thanked Jerry Howard for providing Committee members with a tour of Mesa Grande, and apologized for starting the meeting late.

2. Consider Minutes of February 13, 2003 Regular Meeting

It was moved by David Dean, seconded by Pat Mendivil, to RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF the February 13, 2003 Minutes, as amended.

**Vote: 5 in favor
0 opposed**

3. Items from Citizens Present (no action to be taken)

No items from citizens present. Chair Linoff welcomed those in attendance, noting that Joe Nucci, Historic Preservation Officer for the City of Tempe, was present.

4. **Discuss and Consider the Draft Disposition and Development Agreements for the Mitten and Pomeroy Houses**

Mr. Ron Peters noted a conflict of interest with discussion on the Mitten house.

Mr. Tony Felice reviewed the background of this agenda item, noting that both the Mitten and Pomeroy houses were relocated due to the Mesa Arts Center project. Through the Requests for Proposals process, Mr. John Giles was selected for the Mitten house property, and the Mesa Violin Studios chosen for the Pomeroy house.

Mr. Felice went over the main points of the Disposition and Development Agreements for both properties, stating that the agreements for both houses were being considered within the 90-day negotiation period. Comments from the Historic Preservation Committee and Downtown Development Committee will be included in the continuing negotiations with the applicants.

Chair Linoff suggested that the Disposition and Development Agreement for each house be discussed and voted on separately by Committee members.

Regarding the Mitten house, Mr. Marek noted that it had been delisted when it was moved, but has since been relisted to the National Register.

Mr. David Dean complimented staff on an excellent job in preparing the Disposition and Development Agreement and the conservation easement.

Mr. Dean inquired what the length of term was for the conservation easement.

Mr. Felice responded that the conservation easements for each of the properties would continue in perpetuity.

Mr. Dean asked what recourse the City would have if property owners decide to apply for a demolition permit.

Mr. Felice answered that it would be a violation of the conservation easement, in which case the City would be entitled to reacquire the property.

Chair Linoff expressed concern about how these properties would be monitored in the future, for instance, if there were different staff members 10 years from now.

Mr. Felice acknowledged that was a great point, and stated that the Historic District representative would play a major role in keeping staff informed.

Mr. Marek added that any building permit or demolition permit for these properties would require clearance from the Historic Preservation Officer, who would refer to records on file in the Historic Preservation Office.

Mr. Dean asked if the properties would have a higher degree of review, with more stringent standards applied because of the conservation easements.

Mr. Marek confirmed that holds true because of the conservation easement; additionally, the recorded Disposition and Development Agreement (DDA) would come into play, which would require the consent of the City of Mesa in order to alter the house.

It was moved by David Dean, seconded by Pat Mendivil, to accept the Disposition and Development Agreement for the Mitten house.

**Vote: 4 in favor
0 opposed**

Ron Peters abstained from voting.

Regarding the DDA for the Pomeroy house, Mr. Felice noted that Ms. Patricia Cosand and Dr. William Magers were both present to address any questions the Committee may have.

Chair Linoff asked if Ms. Cosand or Dr. Magers had any comments for the Historic Preservation Committee.

Ms. Cosand stated that they are very excited about getting underway with the project.

Ms. Pat Mendivil commented that she would like to see the Pomeroy house before any changes were made.

Mr. Felice said that he could arrange that for Ms. Mendivil or whoever would like to see the Pomeroy house.

For future agreements, Mr. Ron Peters suggested including the term "*Conservation Easement*" under "*Definitions.*"

Mr. Peters noted there was a duplicated comment in both DDAs stating that the developer would work with the City to place the house on the National Register (the Mitten house is already listed).

Mr. Felice responded that the Mitten house may have been delisted at the time the DDA was drafted, and thanked Mr. Peters for bringing that to staff's attention.

Referring to the part of the DDA that stipulates the Pomeroy house would be available on an annual basis for the Historic Homes Tour, Ms. Tracy Wright Wagner asked if it would still be open for public viewing even if the annual Historic Homes Tour had to be cancelled for some reason.

Mr. Felice noted that perhaps this point could be clarified to state that if a City-sponsored event did not exist, neither would the requirement.

Mr. Dean suggested making the statement generalized to make sure the public will have access to the Pomeroy house annually even if the Historic Homes Tour does not take place.

Mr. Peters asked if there was a requirement in the DDA for the Pomeroy house to be listed on the National Register.

Mr. Felice stated that it was more of an encouragement than a requirement.

Mr. Peters requested that staff ensure this point is included in the DDA, and asked if the owners would be in agreement to go through the National Register listing process.

Ms. Cosand responded that they are working on it; they feel it is to their advantage to have the house listed on the National Register.

It was moved by David Dean, seconded by Pat Mendivil, to accept the Disposition and Development Agreement for the Pomeroy house.

**Vote: 5 in favor
0 opposed**

5. Discuss and Consider a Local Historic Landmark Overlay, Case No. HL03-001TC, for the Federal Building located at 26 N. Macdonald Street (Continued from the February HPC Meeting)

Mr. Marek briefed Committee members on the case, acknowledging that the research and staff report were completed by Katrina Bradshaw. Mr. Marek informed the HPC that they had gathered 115 signatures, 96 of which were deemed valid by the County Recorder's office.

Mr. Marek explained the significance of the Federal Building and how it meets the criteria to be designated as a Local Historic Landmark.

Mr. Marek stated that according to the Historic Building Survey conducted by the Woodward Architectural Group in 1993, the Federal Building is eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places.

Mr. Marek informed HPC members that the Federal Building was declared surplus property by the General Services Administration (GSA) on October 26, 2001. The City of Mesa submitted an application to acquire the building at no cost to be used as an annex to the Mesa Southwest Museum for a combination of public use, program staff offices, and storage. On October 4, 2002, the building was assigned to the City.

Mr. Marek said that the Federal Building meets Criterion A because of the significant contribution to the development of a community. Upon its completion, the post office building became one of the finest found in any city of Mesa's size in the nation. The structure was of a type and size seldom built in cities of less than a population of 20,000. The Federal Building was built in 1936 and 1937 at a cost of \$90,000.

Mr. Marek continued that the significance of the Federal Building was substantiated by the arrival of the Postmaster General, James A. Farley, who attended the dedication as the guest of honor at a banquet at the Mezona Hall. Local postal officials, Democratic leaders, and other community leaders from all parts of Arizona also attended the function. James A. Farley was a nationally prominent man who not only served as United States Postmaster General, but also was Chairman of the Democratic National Committee and managed President Franklin D. Roosevelt's two campaigns for office.

Mr. Marek added that the building meets National Register Criterion C because it retains a high degree of original architectural integrity of design, materials, and workmanship. It is a good example of a Federal Moderne Style building developed by federal architects in the Department of Treasury between 1933 and 1942. The building was expanded in 1959 or 1960 (the specific date of the expansion could not be pinpointed) to include a two-story extension and loading dock. The expansion did not alter the historic integrity of the building. In spite of this large expansion, it became necessary to move the post office in June 1970 to its current location at 135 N. Center Street.

Mr. Marek stated that staff recommends approval of the proposed Local Historic Landmark Overlay for the Federal Building.

Chair Linoff asked if there was some type of agreement with the GAO that the building wouldn't be torn down.

Mr. Marek answered that a deed restriction had been placed on the property that stated any alteration to the building would require approval from the State Historic Preservation Office and the City's Historic Preservation Office.

Mr. Marek added that since the building was obtained by the City at no cost, it has to be maintained as a public use; the application staff put together is for use by the Mesa Southwest Museum, including offices. Since the planned use

is not a change of use, the building could be used without having to bring it up to current building codes. By the time the City is ready to rehabilitate the building, the new rehab code should be in place, which will help any necessary renovations.

Mr. Peters wanted to make sure that it was just the original structure being considered for historic significance and not the addition.

Mr. Marek confirmed that was correct.

Mr. Peters asked if it would be possible to remove the addition.

Mr. Marek said it would require approval based on the deed restriction, but didn't think there would be a problem to remove the addition as long as the original building would be left intact.

Mr. Peters stated he felt the addition built around 1960 changed the integrity of the original building (by scale and massing) and has no relationship architecturally to the original Federal Moderne style of architecture. Mr. Peters expressed concern that this point may come up when going through the process to list the building on the National Register.

Mr. Marek said that it's true that the Historic Sites Review Committee could disagree with Woodward's assessment. Mr. Marek pointed out that the original building is easily distinguished from the addition.

Chair Linoff asked if the design of the building came from the Federal Government.

Mr. Marek stated that the design came from the Department of the Treasury's architects.

Chair Linoff asked about any local association related to the Federal Building.

Mr. Marek noted that the local association comes from the fact that at that time, the Post Office was the focal point of the community. Mr. Marek stated that it was unusual to get that type of higher-level building in the smaller cities and towns across the country.

Ms. Mendivil noted that it may have had something to do with the fact that, at that time, the state of Arizona was mainly Democrat.

Mr. Dean said he would like to see more documentation/background materials to add weight to the significance of the Federal Building, and suggested that he and Ron Peters assist staff in the research.

Mr. Peters agreed to help.

It was moved by David Dean, seconded by Ron Peters, to continue the Local Historic Landmark Overlay, Case No. HL03-001TC, for the Federal Building located at 26 N. Macdonald Street for 90 days in order to obtain more documentation.

**Vote: 5 in favor
0 opposed**

6. Discuss the 2003 Historic Preservation Awards Program

Chair Linoff noted that the issue of the cost of the awards came up at last month's HPC meeting, and the Committee had requested staff to research the cost of previous awards and other possible options.

Mr. Marek informed Committee members that the previous cost per award was \$82.00 plus tax.

Mr. Marek said that this year a total of 3 nominations for the Historic Preservation Awards have been received.

Chair Linoff stated that the award presented by the Committee in the past really seems to be more impressive and stands out more than any of the other options.

Chair Linoff acknowledged that Mr. Ron Peters advised him to continue with the same award design and the cost would be underwritten by Mr. Peters and his firm, BPLW Architects and Engineers.

Chair Linoff thanked Mr. Peters for the offer on behalf of the Committee.

Mr. Marek noted that he believed the Historic Preservation Office would be able to fund the awards for this fiscal year.

HPC members agreed to continue presenting the same award as in the past, and if extra funding is needed, Committee members will find a way to raise the money.

Mr. Marek told Committee members that staff would be sending the Historic Preservation Award nominations to them for review, to be considered at the April 10th HPC meeting.

7. **Discuss Mesa Post War Subdivision Development Context Study – 1947 to 1975**

Mr. Marek briefed Committee members on the progress of implementing the post War context study, which will cost \$25,000. A CLG grant (from the State Historic Preservation Office) of \$10,000 has been awarded for the project, which leaves a remainder of \$15,000 to be funded by the Historic Preservation Office (proposed to be split over 2 fiscal years). The project is on hold until after the budget discussions have been completed, possibly sometime in April. Mr. Marek told the Committee that he would keep them updated.

Chair Linoff noted that a citizen expressed interest in speaking about this agenda item and invited Ms. Jennifer Malhi to address the Committee.

Ms. Malhi (400 block of West 1st Street) stated that her neighborhood is a mixture of post War and World War II era homes, and requested information on how she could help her area be recognized and facilitate preservation of historic homes.

Mr. Felice informed Ms. Malhi that he is actually working with a couple of her neighbors in the Clark West Side Addition to create a historic district. Mr. Felice noted that he would include Ms. Malhi on a list of volunteers.

Mr. Marek added that Ms. Malhi could stop in the Historic Preservation Office to review the Reconnaissance Survey and other information related to her neighborhood.

Chair Linoff thanked Ms. Malhi for her interest in historic preservation and attending the meeting.

8. **Follow-up Discussion on Retreat**

The Committee reviewed some of the main points from their February 22nd retreat.

Committee members expressed appreciation for being able to use the “barn” building at EVIT for their retreat.

Mr. Peters recommended the Committee publish a list of Mesa’s endangered properties warranting further assessment to determine cultural and historic significance to the community.

Mr. Peters gave an example of the orchards as a resource that is being lost.

It was suggested that for Historic Preservation Week, a list could be released showing the threatened resources, lost resources, and restored/saved resources.

Committee members agreed that the public needs to be aware of Mesa's endangered properties.

Mr. Dean recommended that the Committee's endangered properties list focus on five properties at a time.

Mr. Peters added that a request could be published in the newspapers to obtain input of citizens as to which properties they feel should go on the list.

Mr. Dean stated that the press release could coincide with Historic Preservation Week.

Ms. Wright Wagner suggested incorporating the selected 5 endangered properties into the annual Historic Homes Tour.

There was discussion about the possibility of doing a presentation during Historic Preservation Week at a City Council study session to present the endangered properties list. Chair Linoff noted the list could also be presented as part of the Historic Preservation Awards if they couldn't do it at the study session.

Committee members agreed that they would discuss and consider this issue at next month's meeting, and suggested that the following should be considered on the list of endangered properties:

- Mesa Grande
- Buckhorn Baths
- Citrus Groves
- Irving School
- Alhambra Hotel

Mr. Peters added that the Nile Theater could be on the list.

Mr. Marek informed Committee members that staff responded to Council member Janie Thom's inquiry of six possible historic properties. Several of the properties merit further research, including Buckhorn Baths, the Starlight Motel (especially the sign), the old service station building that looks like a castle on Main Street east of Val Vista, and the Circle RB Lodge at 6547 East Main Street.

Mr. Felice told Committee members that the Kellis home across from the Mesa Temple was demolished today. This Tudor Revival house was the LeSeuer Tuxedo store. Mr. Felice added that the house couldn't be moved due to termite infestation.

Mr. Ron Peters asked about the motor court on the east side of Country Club just before the railroad crossing, next to Budget Car Rental.

Mr. Marek said that staff would try to establish a date for the property.

Ms. Mendivil also suggested the possibility of the old store house for the LDS, around 39 N. Mesa Drive on the east side, currently a plumbing company.

Regarding Historic Preservation Week, Mr. David Dean encouraged Committee members to identify strategies to promote historic preservation. Mr. Dean said that Mesa's HPC could get a booth at Phoenix's fair. Mr. Dean also emphasized the importance of issuing the press releases regarding the Endangered Properties List during that week.

Chair Linoff noted that the HPC would be giving a presentation at the Library during Historic Preservation Week, scheduled for May 6th in the Saguaro Room at 7:30 p.m.

Mr. Felice stated that the press releases would include information about:

- The Endangered Properties List
- Historic Preservation Awards
- The presentation at the Library
- That month's event at the Mesa Historical Museum

Chair Linoff noted that the common thread for the press releases would be to emphasize Historic Preservation Week.

Mr. Dean suggested that if there were any Historic District street signs to be installed it would be appropriate to schedule the installation during Historic Preservation Week.

Mr. Marek noted that Fraser Fields would be a possibility.

9. **Director's Report**

Mr. Marek informed Committee members that SHPO had received a protest letter regarding the National Register nomination of the Arizona Temple, submitted by the Salt Lake City LDS office. Staff is looking into it, but feels that it is probably just a matter of miscommunication since church officials had previously agreed to include the Temple in the Temple Historic District.

Ms. Sandra Apsey discussed the May 6th program to be held at the Library during Historic Preservation Week. She said she would like to have the presentation be about an hour long, and give examples of properties that were lost, properties that are threatened, and what has been accomplished in saving historic resources.

Ms. Wright Wagner suggested the possibility of the Mesa Historical Museum being a co-sponsor for this event (e.g., refreshments).

Mr. Jerry Howard updated Committee members on a joint workshop sponsored by the Center for Environmental Studies at ASU, the Mesa Museum and the Arizona State Museum. Experts that have worked with anthropological studies of irrigation societies around the world were brought in to discuss their work and Hohokam irrigation.

Mr. Howard stated it looked like the Mesa Southwest Museum would be hosting the 2004 Archaeology Expo.

Committee members expressed their appreciation once again for the tour Mr. Howard provided of Mesa Grande.

10. Update Regarding Mesa Historical Museum from Tracy Wright Wagner

Ms. Wright Wagner reminded the HPC that the Mesa Historical Museum's barbecue/fundraiser would be on Saturday, March 15th.

Ms. Wright Wagner stated that the next speaker of the "Agriculture in Arizona" lecture series would be Jose Cortez on March 20th.

11. Committee Member Comments and Questions and Future Agenda Items

Chair Linoff reminded Committee members to keep in contact with their designated Council member.

12. Adjournment

7:49 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Gregory J. Marek, Historic Preservation Officer
Minutes prepared by Kathy Guthmiller