

City of Mesa

MINUTES OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMITTEE

Date: June 7, 2007 **Time:** 6:00 p.m.

| MEMBERS PRESENT | STAFF PRESENT | OTHERS PRESENT |
|--|-------------------|--|
| Ron Peters, Chair Lane Burdick, Vice Chair Barbara Jarrett Steve McCance Nathan Ricks Jared Smith | Stephanie Brüning | Don Ryden, Ryden Architects Citizens: Christine Close Geraldine & John Thiele Sarah Fox Traci Asbury Sandy Sutton Andrews Lewis & Jo Popp Ryan & Rhiannon Vincent Karen Carrera Bruce England Raymond R. Pyke Jana M. Nash Pam Snow Marcos P. Ramon Audrey Luna |
| MEMBERS ABSENT | SUPPORT PRESENT | |
| | Julie Moran | |

1. Call to Order
The June 7, 2007 Meeting of the Historic Preservation Committee (HPC) was called to order at 6:00 p.m.

Committee members all present! Congrats to them!
2. Consider Minutes of the April 12, 2007 meeting
Motion – Ms. Jarrett moved to approve the minutes.
Seconded – Mr. Smith
Approved unanimously
3. Don Ryden of Ryden Architects presentation of findings regarding significance of the Neighborhood. Discuss questions Committee members may have.

Public comments:

Christine Close, resident of 508 West Clark Street spoke and expressed her desire for the Committee to approve the proposal of staff to move forward. The neighborhood has been working on this since 2002 through many staff changes, and all are very excited about this.

Jo Popp, resident of 533 West Pepper, inquired if Historic Designation would change the zoning of the property. Ms. Brüning responded that it does not affect zoning. The current zoning would remain.

Marcos Ramon, resident of 521 West Pepper, owns a home for the elderly in the neighborhood and asked how the historic designation would affect his home. Ms. Brüning responded again, that the zoning in effect would remain so and if it was approved for that use, it would not change.

Chairman Peters stressed that owners contact the Historic Preservation Officer before making any changes to the appearance.

Public comments closed.

Opened for comments from Committee members.

Members complimented Mr. Ryden on detailed report and documentation.

Motion - Mr. Smith moved to direct staff to move forward with the National Register nomination.

Seconded – Ms. Jarrett

Approved unanimously

4. Discuss and Consider Historic Clearance – Work conducted without a clearance at 548 North Grand within the Evergreen Historic District without a historic clearance.

The house is listed as a **CONTRIBUTING** structure within the historic district.

The owner is seeking Historic Clearance approval for the work previously conducted and requests the approval of new work which includes according to the application: restuccoing the exterior of the house.

Staff Recommendations:

The original c.1938 stucco to the finish of the house had been compromised by previous alterations to the house. The new finish is similar to one of the finishes shown in the pictures prior to restuccoing and Staff recommends that the application be approved as meeting the Secretary of Interior Standards and the City of Mesa Code.

The property owner was in attendance and brought pictures of how the home originally looked in the 1930's. She asked that in the future an application be put in place for seeking clearance to work on homes in the historic district.

Motion: Mr. Ricks moved to approve actions as recommended by Staff.

Seconded: Ms. Jarrett seconded the motion.

Approved unanimously

5. Discuss and Consider Historic Clearance – Work conducted without a clearance at 705 N Robson within the Evergreen Historic District without a historic clearance.

The house is listed as **CONTRIBUTING** structure within the historic district.

The owner is seeking Historic Clearance approval for the work previously conducted and requests the approval of new work which includes according to the application: demolition and reconfiguration of the construction of the front porch.

Staff Recommendation: The original construction of the porch at 705 North Robson is a unique character-defining feature of the c. 1928 property. The application for review and approval of the construction conducted without a Historic Clearance does not meet the Secretary of Interior's Standards and therefore staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Committee should not approve. According to the City of Mesa Code, if the application is not approved the owner of the site shall be required to restore the site to a similar manner and form to that which existed previously.

To return the porch to its original c.1928 architectural details the following should be completed, along with any other details: center box pillars should be lowered to match the exterior trapezoid pillars, the semi-wall under the covered porch section should be returned to its original dimensions, the rafters should be placed horizontally as originally designed.

The porch should appear as it was originally built prior to demolition.

The property owners, Mr. and Mrs. John Thiele, were in attendance and apologized for not realizing they had to obtain historic clearance. They indicated the wood was rotting and unsafe, and the roof was sagging. Their son-in-law did the work for them. They took responsibility and are now seeking historic clearance for the work done.

Discussion followed with the Committee and the owners about the impact the changes made relative to its appearance in keeping with the style and character of the home. Mr. Smith indicated that changing one element does make a difference, although relatively small. Chairman Peters strongly suggested that in the future, they work directly with Ms. Brüning to obtain historic clearance prior to the work being done.

Motion: Mr. Smith moved to approve actions as recommended by Staff.

Seconded: Mr. McCance seconded the motion.

Friendly amendment to the motion: Mr. Burdick moved to allow the rafters including the changes at the end.

Mr. McCance stressed that Staff's recommendation was to put the porch back to the way it was. We can't pick and choose—the Staff's recommendation was based on the Secretary of the Interior Standards. If one element is allowed and not another, it sets a confusing precedent to homeowners.

Motion - Mr. Smith moved to approve actions as recommended by Staff.

Seconded - Mr. McCance seconded the motion.

Approved unanimously

6. Discuss and Consider Historic Clearance – Work conducted without a clearance at 505 N Grand within the Evergreen Historic District without a historic clearance.

The house is listed as **CONTRIBUTING** structure within the historic district.

The owner is seeking Historic Clearance approval for the work previously conducted and requests the approval of new work which includes according to the application: construction of wall to enclose the backyard and new gate.

Staff Recommendation:

The completion of an enclosed rear yard to the c. 1938 house does not compromise the historic integrity of the house. It is recommended that the application be approved as meeting the Secretary of Interior's Standards and the City of Mesa Code.

The owners, Mr. And Mrs. Vincent were in attendance and indicated all work had stopped pending the Committee's decision. The home has been Mrs. Vincent's family home for several generations.

Motion - Mr. McCance moved to accept the recommendations made by Staff for the property at 501 North Grand.

Seconded: Mr. Smith

Approved unanimously

7. Discuss and Consider Historic Clearance – Work conducted without a clearance at 143 North Fraser within the Fraser Fields Historic District without a historic clearance.

The house is listed as **CONTRIBUTING** structure within the historic district.

The owner is seeking Historic Clearance approval for the work previously conducted and requests the approval of new work which includes according to the application: construction of wall to enclose the backyard and related gates with a barbed wire border.

The owner, Ms Sarah Fox, was in attendance and indicated that when she purchased the home recently, it was not disclosed that it was in an historic

district. The barbed wire will be along the wall in the alleyway and is a safety/security issue however; she has removed all razor wire.

Recommendation:

The completion of an enclosed rear yard to the c. 1958 house does not compromise the historic integrity of the house and cannot be seen from the front of the house. It is recommended that the application be approved as meeting the Secretary of Interior Standards and the City of Mesa Code.

Motion - Mr. Ricks moved to accept the recommendations of Staff for 143 North Fraser Drive

Seconded - Ms. Jarrett seconded.

Approved unanimously

8. Item not on agenda – Committee members leaving and election of new officers

Leaving: Chairman Ron Peters, Vice Chairman Lane Burdick, and Committee member Nathan Ricks

Staying: Steve McCance, Jared Smith, and Barbara Jarrett

Ms. Brüning suggested that officers be elected so that she can continue to work with the Committee over the next few months until the next meeting.

By acclamation, Steve McCance was elected Chairman, with Jared Smith as Vice Chairman.

9. Update: Mesa Southwest Museum & Mesa Historical Museum

- Ms. Brüning reported that a lot is going on at the Mesa Southwest Museum.
 - IMAX is coming in the fall coordinating with the museum
 - They are looking into changing the name and are looking for support.
 - Action – The HPC directed staff to write a letter for the Chairman’s signature in support of the name change to more accurately reflect what the Museum is all about.
- Mr. Smith indicated the Mesa Historical Museum continues in its efforts
 - A new exhibit will be coming in September: Wallace & Ladmo
 - Repainting and landscaping projects are ongoing.

10. Update: Project Status Report: June 2007

A copy of the Project Status Report was distributed in Committee members’ packets. The following subjects were covered:

- Clark West Side Addition Historic District
- Post World War II study
- Fraser Field National Register
- Adaptive Reuse of the Dr. Alston House:
- 1912 Steam Locomotive in Pioneer Park
- Historic Preservation Awards

- Design Guideline Update
- West Main Street Sub-Area Plan
- Escobedo

11. Items from Citizens Present
None

12. Committee Member Comments, Questions, and Future Agenda Items

- Appreciation expressed to outgoing Committee Chair Ron Peters, Vice Chair Lane Burdick, and Member Nathan Ricks. By acclamation, new Chairman is Steve McCance and Vice Chair is Jared Smith.
- Staff directed to prepare letters from the Committee to the City Council formally stating the position of the Committee regarding:
 1. The sale of the Escobedo property and other historical district properties-- the importance of historic preservation to the City of Mesa and its citizens;
 2. Full support of the name change for the Mesa Historical Museum.

13. Update: Historic Preservation Officer Report

- Ms. Brüning and Ms. Tesarek will be attending the 2007 Historic Preservation Partnership Conference in Prescott June 13-16.
- Ms. Brüning is researching a potential system assessing owners an administrative cost when they conduct work without Historic Clearance on their historic property.

13. Update: The next meeting is scheduled for **August 9, 2007** at Mesa City Council Chambers, Lower Level, 57 East First Street. (Dates are subject to change).

Motion: Mr. Smith moved to adjourn the June 7, 2007, meeting of the HPC.

Seconded: Mr. Burdick

Approved unanimously

Adjourned at 8:16 p.m.