



Approved Minutes
Historic Preservation Board

Date: September 1, 2015

Time: 6:00 p.m.

Location: 1st Evangelical Lutheran Church of Mesa
 142 N. Date

| Members Present | Members Absent | Staff Present | Guests |
|---|----------------|---------------|------------|
| Janice Gennevois, Chair Wendy Mack-Allred, Vice Chair Jim Taylor Annalisa Alvrus, Ph.D. Laura Schaffer-Metcalf, Ed.D. Greg Marek Louise Swann | | John Wesley | Vic Linoff |

1. Call meeting to order

Chair Gennevois called the meeting to order at 6:06 p.m.

2. Approval of the August 4, 2015 minutes

First motion made by Vice Chair Mack-Allred to approve the minutes and seconded by Board member Swann.

Motion carried 7-0

3. Review and consider a request for Historic Landmark Designation for property at 412 N. Macdonald.

John Wesley provided a brief background and overview of the request. Based on the quality of the building as a craftsman bungalow, the fact it was built by Joseph Nesbitt (a prominent builder in Mesa), and its association with Phil Isley who was a prominent citizen in Mesa and Arizona, staff recommends approval of the Historic Landmark designation.

Heather Scantlebury, 120 W. University, property owner and applicant provided an overview of the building and Mr. Isley to the Board. Some additional pictures and information were also distributed.

Vice chair Mack-Allred asked about some of the modifications being made to the front and side of the building. Ms. Scantlebury replied that the front was being restored to the original design and the details on the side were being maintained.

Board member Taylor asked about the statements in the staff report regarding the building code and if the structure was visible from a street. If it is not visible from a street, what criteria would be used in the future for a certificate of appropriateness? Ms. Scantlebury replied that she had been working with the Building Official and Fire Marshal and had been to the Building Board of Appeals on how to renovate this home. She is being required to put in sprinklers and may have to extend a fire hydrant. She acknowledged that the home will not be visible from a street. Mr.

Wesley pointed to the criteria outlined in the staff report as to how staff would approach a certificate of appropriateness for this property.

First motion made by Board member Shaffer-Metcalf to recommend approval of the HL overlay for 412 N. Macdonald and seconded by Board member Alvrus.

Board member Marek expressed appreciation for the work Ms. Scantlebury is doing to preserve this home. However, he had reservations about giving this structure the historic landmark designation. His concerns centered around his feeling that there was not a need to further designate a craftsman bungalow structure as a landmark, it was not that unique and that while Mr. Isley was prominent, he was not that prominent in terms of significant contributions to Mesa to distinguish this structure from many other homes in Mesa where prominent people have lived. He was concerned that if this structure is approved we will be lowering the bar as to what qualifies and will get too many applicants. Vice chair Mack-Allred also expressed some concerns for the lack of visibility of the home.

Ms. Scantlebury reiterated some of the Mr. Isley's accomplishments and the role he played in the community. She also noted there are not that many craftsman bungalows from this time period that are still intact in Mesa.

Board member Taylor also expressed concerns with the designation given that the home will not be visible. He also questioned the integrity of the building.

Chair Genevois called for a vote on the motion to approve the application.

Motion carried 5-2 (Boardmembers Taylor and Marek, nay)

4. Review the role of the Historic Preservation Program and Historic Preservation Board

John Wesley provided a brief overview of the role of the Historic Preservation Office, the Board, and the value of the national and local designations. Each Board member introduced themselves and stated their interest in historic preservation.

5. Review and discuss the establishment of a Historic District for the West Side Clark neighborhood

Chair Genevois opened the floor for questions and comments from the citizens present to learn where they are in the effort to establish a local district for West Side Clark and how the Board could help them move forward.

John Hayes, 430 W. Clark, asked about the impact of the Prop 207 waivers on getting approval of the local designation. Mr. Wesley responded that the Council has been requiring these waivers for all zoning cases. Because it is proven that historic designation increases property values, it is hoped that the Council would approve the zoning designation for this area without 100% of the property owners signing the waiver. We will not know if they will do that until a case would get to them. It is best for the neighbors to try and get as close as possible and to show the Council there is widespread neighborhood interest in having the designation.

Christine Close of 508 W. Clark, said some neighbors have been concerned about what they will be able to do with their property if the designation is approved. Mr. Wesley reviewed the requirements for a certificate of appropriateness for exterior modifications. Board member Taylor referred the group to the Secretary of the Interior standards, 36 CFR 68 for the standards that are used by the staff and the Board if there is an appeal of a staff decision.

Christine Close, 508 W. Clark, asked about using the previous signatures on petitions from the last time the neighborhood tried to get the local designation. Board member Taylor stated the Council will want to see current signatures. Ms. Close also asked about how to get the property

tax reduction. Vice chair Mack-Allred reviewed the requirements and stated she was available to help anyone who wanted to apply.

Ben Bidwell, 515 W. Pepper, stated his support for creation of the local district.

6. Update on information for the student writing contest for the coming year

Board member Schaffer-Metcalf updated the Board on her activities to start getting the word out about the current contest. She has been in contact with Mesa Public Schools. She is working with Mr. Wesley on a flyer to distribute.

7. Prepare for the 2nd Friday event in downtown Mesa on September 11, 2015

Vice Chair Mack-Allred and Board member Taylor are prepared for the event.

8. Update on Buckhorn Baths

Chair Genevois stated she submitted the request to the City Manager regarding having the detailed survey work done of the buildings as discussed at the last meeting. He stated the bond funds could not be used for that, but encouraged the Board to submit a budget request for next year's budget.

Board member Alvrus stated she has been speaking with a colleague at Mesa Community College about this project. There may be an opportunity to make it a student project.

Board member Marek stated there is now a For Sale sign on the property, they are asking \$4 million.

9. Updates on Museums, Exhibits, Committees and Events related to Historic Preservation

Chair Genevois updated the Board on the meeting she had with the Mayor and City Manager along with Vice Chair Mack-Allred and Board member Marek. They were able to speak with the Mayor about historic signs and he expressed his support for saving these signs. With regards to the idea funding a contract position to handle the historic preservation office, the Mayor and City Manager were supportive, but it would have to be an item in next year's budget. They encouraged Mr. Wesley to develop a proposal.

10. Board Member comments, questions, and future agenda items

Board member Taylor asked about the booth at the light rail opening event. Chair Genevois provided an update.

The following were suggested as agenda items for the next meeting:

- West Side Clark update
- Buckhorn update
- 2nd Friday event
- Main Street shade structures

11. Adjournment

Chair Genevois adjourned the meeting at 7:45 pm.

First Motion made by Board member Shaffer-Metcalf and seconded by Board member Taylor. Motion carried 7-0

Supporting data is available for public review in the Planning Division,
Municipal Building, 55 N. Center St., Mesa, Arizona 85201

The City of Mesa is committed to making its public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. For special accommodations, please contact the Neighborhood Services Administration Office at 644-2387 or 644-2778 (TDD) at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting. Para asistencia en Español, llamar (480) 644-5597.