

CITY OF MESA

MINUTES OF THE *HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMITTEE*

DATE: April 8, 2004 **TIME:** 6:00 p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT	STAFF PRESENT	OTHERS PRESENT
Chair Victor Linoff David Dean Vince Anderson Pat Mendivil Lori Osiecki Ron Peters Tracy Wright Wagner	Sandra Apsey Kathy Guthmiller Jerry Howard Lenny Hulme Greg Marek Kevin Martin Steve Stettler	Virginia Aguero Gary Apsey Liz Wilson
MEMBERS ABSENT		
None		

1. Call to Order.

The April 8, 2004 Regular Meeting of the Historic Preservation Committee was called to order at 6:04 p.m.

2. Consider Minutes of March 11, 2004 Regular Meeting.

It was moved by David Dean, seconded by Vince Anderson, to RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF the March 11, 2004 Minutes, as amended.

**Vote: 7 in favor
0 opposed**

Chair Linoff inquired if the minutes from the HPC Retreat should also be voted on at this time so they could be forwarded to the City Council for review.

Mr. Marek informed the Committee that it was not required for the Retreat minutes to be approved, just the regular monthly meeting minutes.

A general discussion took place, and it was decided to include the Retreat minutes as an attachment to the regular HPC minutes.

It was moved by David Dean, seconded by Lori Osiecki, to include the March 6, 2004 HPC Retreat minutes as an attachment to the March 11, 2004 regular meeting minutes, referencing such attachment under item #8, Retreat Follow-up.

**Vote: 6 in favor
1 opposed (Ron Peters)**

3. Items from Citizens Present (no action to be taken).

No items from citizens present.

4. Discuss and Consider Tree Replacement in the West 2nd Street Historic District

Ms. Lori Osiecki declared a conflict of interest on this agenda item since she lives in the West 2nd Street Historic District.

Mr. Lenny Hulme, Streets Maintenance Superintendent, introduced Steve Stettler, landscape architect from the City's Engineering Division and Kevin Martin, the contract specialist in the Streets Maintenance Department for the landscape area to be addressed.

Mr. Hulme gave a Power Point presentation to the Committee, outlining the responsibilities of the Streets Maintenance Department in regards to the City of Mesa's landscape maintenance. Mr. Hulme discussed the tree selection process and some of the issues faced, highlighting the advantages of the trees that were chosen to replace trees in the West 2nd Street Historic District and showing examples of the types of existing trees in this neighborhood.

Mr. Hulme stated that the tree selection is determined using guidelines set by the Arizona Department of Water Resources (ADWR). Research had been done to determine which tree would best replace some of the citrus trees, meeting the guidelines' criteria and also being appropriate to the area. Desirable characteristics to consider in tree selection include, minimal maintenance, low water use, rapid growth rate, non-obstructing to traffic, and long life span.

Mr. Hulme noted that taking into account ADWR's guidelines, the research compiled, the recommendations of nurseries, and the other types of trees in the area, the shade tree selected as the best replacement candidate was the Sissoo tree. The Sissoo tree is an evergreen, fast-growing tree, with no thorns, low maintenance requirements, and a large canopy. Mr. Hulme addressed the concern of potential sprawling roots of the Sissoo tree, but noted the medians in this area are 35 feet wide, and on both sides there is 24 feet of asphalt, the sidewalk and foundations are even farther back. Also, Mr. Hulme pointed out that with these areas being flood irrigation, the roots would not travel outside of the water pattern/median area.

Mr. Hulme noted that he didn't realize until this project that the medians themselves were considered to be part of the Historic District. After finding out some of the neighborhood residents were unhappy about the citrus trees being removed, research was undertaken to determine comparable trees for the area.

Mr. Hulme showed slides of a variety of shade trees that are proposed possibilities for replacing the removed citrus trees.

Mr. Hulme stated that he is requesting guidance from the Historic Preservation Committee on how to proceed from this point, noting that the planting cycle is nearing the end for this season.

Chair Linoff expressed appreciation for the work done by Deanna Villanueva-Saucedo, of the Neighborhood Outreach department, in compiling the comments from the April 7th neighborhood meeting.

Chair Linoff said that everyone could learn from what happened, pointing out that communication between City departments regarding historic districts needs to improve, making sure that the Historic Preservation Office is consulted before any work is conducted in historic districts.

Mr. Peters commented that the landscaping features are part of the fabric of historic neighborhoods, and the tree/plant selection pallets may need to be reevaluated, taking into consideration the City of Mesa's growing number of historic districts.

Mr. Hulme agreed that a specific pallet should be determined for historic districts, and asked the HPC to advise them on what trees should be included.

Mr. Steve Stettler addressed HPC members, saying that he feels the Committee has an obligation to contextually evaluate each of the historic district's landscaping to determine the appropriate plant selection pallet based on the history of the neighborhood.

Mr. Stettler also noted that citrus trees are expensive, pose the potential threat of roof rats and have a shorter lifespan than many other plants/trees that are available in the current selection pallets.

Mr. Stettler stated that the decision to determine the tree/plant selection pallet should be made by the Historic Preservation Committee and/or the residents of the area after investigating all of the relevant issues and determining their validity.

Mr. David Dean asked if the citrus trees in the West 2nd Street Historic District medians were the ones planted by the original developer.

Mr. Stettler responded he doubted that they were, since residents have stated they believed those citrus trees have been there for only about 40 or 50 years.

Chair Linoff noted that it would be helpful to have the research showing what was originally planted in the medians.

Chair Linoff asked if it was possible to get a waiver to replace a citrus tree that dies with another citrus tree (since citrus trees are not on the ADWR approved tree list because of high water usage).

Mr. Stettler answered that it was his understanding that it was possible, but he'd have to research the answer to that question. Mr. Stettler noted that in non-historic areas, citrus may not be planted in City right-of-way areas.

Chair Linoff stated that he feels the role of the Committee should be to explore what, from a historic standpoint consistent with National Register standards, would be appropriate for the medians in question, and then consult with the residents of the historic district for their recommendations.

Mr. Dean asked if any federal funds are included in the Streets Maintenance budget for these projects.

Mr. Hulme replied that they don't have any federally funded grants.

Mr. Dean noted that he asked because with the use of State or Federal funds, it may kick off a NEPA (Section 106) Review, and the State Historic Preservation Office would then be involved in the expenditure and approval of those funds.

Mr. Dean commented that since trees only have a limited life cycle, any particular tree doesn't reflect the significance of a historic district; replacement trees could be picked from documentation at any point in time.

Mr. Dean agreed with the Streets Maintenance department about having an acceptable pallet of trees for the historic districts, either as a snapshot in time of today's decision making (taking into consideration environmental and budgetary issues), or more reflective of a historic pallet. Mr. Dean added that he felt in either case, the tree pallet shouldn't be limited to only what's currently in the historic districts. The tree pallet selection should be reflective of the feeling, size, and scale of the neighborhood. Mr. Dean stated that choosing citrus alternatives is a viable option worth researching.

Mr. Marek noted that since the tree-planting season is almost over, it would be beneficial for the HPC to take the time to do more research and report back to the Streets Maintenance department another time. Mr. Marek noted that staff hasn't had a chance to speak with the State Historic Preservation Office to find out how they've been dealing with the Department of Water Resources tree list in other cities' historic districts.

Mr. Marek stated that the West 2nd Street Historic District's National Register nomination was unique because the medians (including the orange trees) were specifically mentioned as part of the character defining features of the neighborhood.

Mr. Vince Anderson agreed that more research was needed to determine a tree selection pallet for the entire West 2nd Street Historic District, commenting that other types of trees prevalent in the neighborhood need to be taken into consideration, such as the Eucalyptus trees which may be nearing the end of their life span.

Mr. Hulme added that the Streets Department will also want to have it clearly defined as to who is responsible for what in the landscape area of historic districts.

Mr. Peters complimented the Streets Department on doing a good job of selecting a nice pallet of trees appropriate for the downtown area. Mr. Peters said that he believed, historically, that the tree commonly planted was the California Pepper tree; thus, the name "Pepper Place" for one of

the downtown streets. The Pepper trees were all cut down and aren't normally planted because they take a lot of water and are messy. Mr. Peters agreed with Mr. Dean that it's more important to preserve the character of the tree (size, color, etc.).

Ms. Virginia Aguero, resident of the West 2nd Street Historic District, addressed the Committee, thanking them for the opportunity to speak. Ms. Aguero noted that her neighbors got to know her well when she went door to door at the time she worked on the expansion of the West 2nd Street Historic District.

Ms. Aguero stated that she noticed trees being removed and had asked what was going on, to which she was told they were being replaced with other orange trees. Then when Ms. Aguero read the newspaper article about trees being replaced with the Sisso tree (native to India) and, along with other residents, became concerned for the historic significance of the neighborhood and spoke to the Streets Maintenance engineer, Ted Stalder, who referred her to Mr. Lenny Hulme. Ms. Aguero contacted Mr. Hulme, who informed her that the citrus trees taken out were to be replaced with other trees. Ms. Aguero said that she spoke to Mr. Hulme about the concerns of neighborhood residents regarding this situation taking place in a historic district.

Ms. Aguero noted that she and other residents remember seeing those citrus trees for as long as they've lived there, some of those residents having been there for about 60 years. Ms. Aguero stated that the neighborhood residents were not even notified about the tree replacement. Ms. Aguero added that there were big holes from where trees were removed left open for a couple of weeks, posing a potential danger to neighborhood children or to pedestrians. Ms. Aguero called Mr. Hulme again and within several days there was caution tape put up around the area of the holes.

Ms. Aguero commented that when a meeting was called, she received a notice, but the neighbors on West 3rd Place did not receive the notices, so several of them wrote letters that Ms. Aguero gave to Deanna Villanueva-Saucedo of the Neighborhood Outreach department.

Ms. Aguero stated that she does not understand how the citrus trees can be replaced with other trees and still maintain the historic integrity of the West 2nd Street Historic District.

Ms. Aguero said that she realizes there are budgetary concerns for replacing the citrus trees with other citrus trees. She suggested the possibility of applying for a grant from the Arizona Heritage Fund to help with the expenses. Ms. Aguero noted that other suggestions were

gathered at the neighborhood meeting, such as the City of Mesa applying for a variance to plant citrus trees in the medians of historic districts. Ms. Aguero suggested more time for continued research would be helpful, and told the Committee that, with the help of Sandra Apsey in the Mesa Room, she had discovered an old Ordinance referring to a tree committee.

Chair Linoff thanked Ms. Aguero for her involvement and showing pride in the West 2nd Street Historic District, adding that there is a window of time now before the next planting season to do more research and have the neighborhood, Streets Maintenance department, and Historic Preservation Office and Committee work together to determine the best options appropriate for tree replacement in the West 2nd Street Historic District.

Mr. Dean asked if documentation is needed to make sure the recommendations of the Committee and suggestions from the neighborhoods are accurately reflected in a plan, and that procedures are followed consistently to make sure communication is occurring between the appropriate parties.

Mr. Marek responded that no formal plan is required at this point now that communication is taking place and the Historic Preservation Office is involved.

Mr. Peters asked if the Streets Department is restricted from planting citrus.

Mr. Hulme noted that they have guidelines they have to follow.

Mr. Stettler added that the AZ Department of Water Quality states that citrus should not be planted, but it is his understanding that this stipulation could be waived in an historical context.

Mr. Peters commented that one of the things needed would be a waiver from that department.

Mr. Marek stated that staff would look into it and provide a status report to the HPC in a few months.

Mr. Hulme noted that there are two trees that were transplanted that don't look like they're going to make it, so the Streets Department will probably be in the neighborhood doing some work to replace them.

Mr. Stettler added that maybe the Neighborhood Outreach department should be involved in the process since they're also familiar with the districts and the neighborhood contacts.

Mr. Dean suggested that if any of the historic district residents had any concerns they wanted to bring up to the HPC or relay to the Neighborhood Outreach department, they were welcome to address them at the monthly Historic Preservation Committee meetings.

5. **Discuss and Receive a Presentation on the Post World War II Study by Liz Wilson**

Mr. Marek introduced Ms. Liz Wilson, who has been working with Debbie Abele on the City of Mesa's post World War II study. Mr. Marek noted that their final report is due next month, and Ms. Wilson would be presenting their findings to the Committee and discuss the format that the final report will take, along with recommendations on how to proceed.

Ms. Liz Wilson addressed the Committee, giving a PowerPoint presentation summarizing findings of the study on post war single family subdivision development in Mesa, primarily from 1946 to 1973. Ms. Wilson acknowledged that the bulk of the study was really like a glorified survey of these post war developments. Maricopa County Assessor data was supplemented with field survey work to better understand the general trends, patterns and physical attributes that characterize post war residential subdivision development in Mesa.

Ms. Wilson noted that she and Debbie Abele identified 305 subdivision plats, where at least 50% of the parcels in those plats were for single family homes, and at least 50% of those homes were constructed between 1946 and 1973. Then, plats were grouped into developments, depending on whether or not they shared a similar name and were adjacent to each other.

Ms. Wilson continued that the 305 subdivision plats that they began with were grouped into 197 different developments. As a note of comparison, Ms. Wilson said that Scottsdale had 103 developments for the same period of time, and in both studies there were a similar number of single family homes. This suggests that the subdivision developments in Mesa are characterized by much smaller scale, in terms of number of houses.

Ms. Wilson pointed out areas of concentration and other maps and information, utilizing slides in the PowerPoint presentation. Topics covered included:

- typical residential development
- typical single family house
- early suburban developments
- first boom developments
- second boom developments

Ms. Wilson concluded by noting the recommendations for future study include:

- create a specialized subcommittee to study postwar developments
- start with early suburban developments
- consider representative developments
- consider unique developments
- evaluate integrity in teams of two
- make decisions regarding designation of residential historic districts

Committee members thanked Ms. Wilson for her presentation and all the work she and Ms. Abele have done.

Mr. Marek informed Committee members that after the draft final report is received from Ms. Wilson and Ms. Abele, a copy will be provided for HPC members to review and provide any comments to include in the final report.

Mr. Marek noted that the HPC will need to discuss the approach they want to take once the post World War II GIS study has been finalized.

6. Discuss and Consider the 2004 Historic Preservation Awards Nominations.

Chair Linoff acknowledged that Committee members had submitted their individual rankings of Historic Preservation Awards nominees to staff, and tabulation of the results had been handed out to Committee members.

HPC members had a discussion about how many awards to give out this year, taking into consideration the number and quality of nominations received.

Ms. Tracy Wright Wagner stated she felt that three awards was the optimal number.

Ms. Lori Osiecki agreed that all of the nominees have contributed a great deal to Mesa's history, but the number of recipients should be limited to three.

Mr. Vince Anderson noted that when he was ranking the nominations, five of them stood out more to him than the others, but he understood the reasoning to limit the number of awards to three.

Ms. Wright Wagner said she would like to see nominees that didn't receive an award this year be automatically re-nominated for next year.

Regarding the nominees not receiving this year's award, Mr. Peters suggested that a letter be sent to the nominators encouraging them to resubmit for next year, allowing them the opportunity to provide any new or additional information.

The Committee agreed with Mr. Peters, and Mr. Dean added that HPC members could try to contact the nominators before next year's awards to remind them about resubmitting their nominations.

Committee members came to the consensus that the number of Historic Preservation awards presented this year be limited to three. Chair Linoff will call the 2004 Historic Preservation Award recipients, who will also be receiving letters. Follow up letters will be sent to the other submitters whose nominees are not receiving this year's award. Past award recipients will also receive a letter inviting them to join in honoring this year's recipients at the City Council meeting on May 3, 2004.

It was moved by Vince Anderson, seconded by David Dean, to name the top three ranked nominations as the 2004 Historic Preservation Awards recipients, to be made public knowledge in an upcoming press release.

**Vote: 7 in favor
0 opposed**

7. Discuss Historic Preservation Week

Chair Linoff noted that the main event held during Historic Preservation Week would be the Historic Preservation Awards.

Also in conjunction with Historic Preservation Week, a presentation entitled "Lost but not Forgotten" will be given by Chair Linoff and Ron Peters at the Mesa Main Library on Saturday, May 8th at 1 p.m.

Mr. Anderson suggested the possibility of including the Endangered Resources Poster with the distribution of the press release of the City Council presentation of Historic Preservation Awards.

Mr. David Dean noted that a poster could also be presented to the Historic Preservation Award recipients.

Chair Linoff added that the posters could be available at the “Lost but not Forgotten” presentation on May 8th.

8. Discuss and Consider Historic Preservation Graphic Element

Nothing new to report on this item currently.

9. Director’s Report

Mr. Marek thanked Mr. Dean, Ms. Wright Wagner and Ms. Mendivil for volunteering their time at the Arizona Archaeology Expo.

Mr. Marek congratulated Mr. Jerry Howard on receiving the Governor’s award for Public Archaeology.

Mr. Marek informed the Committee that the Historic Preservation Office submitted applications on time for two Heritage Fund Grants, one for a Building Condition Assessment report for the Irving School and the other for the preparation of National Register nominations for the Fraser Fields and West Side Clark Addition neighborhoods.

Mr. Marek stated that the resolution approving these applications would be up for approval by City Council on April 19th. Mr. Marek added that the introduction of the ordinance for historic designation of The Landmark Restaurant would be at the same Council meeting.

Mr. Marek reminded Committee members about the State Historic Preservation Conference to be held July 29 – 31 and asked who was planning to attend.

Chair Linoff, Mr. Dean, Mr. Anderson, Ms. Mendivil and Ron Peters stated they plan to attend the conference; Ms. Wright Wagner noted she wasn’t able to confirm at this time, and Ms. Osiecki said she would be unable to attend. Mr. Peters and Mr. Dean noted they would handle their own registrations and payment for the conference. Chair Linoff and Mr. Anderson commented that if there are budget problems, they could take care of their portion of the conference costs, too.

Mr. Marek informed the Committee that the City is initiating a zoning change in the area along Pecos Road. The Historic Preservation Office has sent a letter to the Planning Department asking them to place stipulations on that zoning to have archaeological testing/data recovery be required.

10. Update from Sandra Apsey, Mesa Room.

Ms. Sandra Apsey told the Committee that the Mesa Room has been keeping busy, helping different groups and City departments research various projects.

Regarding the research done on the West Second Street Historic District trees, Ms. Apsey noted that so far they found the Ordinance, and she has plans to do more research on what was previously planted in that neighborhood.

Ms. Apsey stated that she had the opportunity to obtain an oral history from Mr. Randolph Jenks, who was a student at the Evans Boys' Ranch in 1929, and his brother went to the Palo Verde Ranch School in 1933.

Ms. Apsey noted she's looking forward to the presentation, "Lost but not Forgotten," to be given by Chair Linoff and Mr. Peters on May 8th at 1 p.m. in the Mesa Main Library.

11. Update from Southwest Museum.

Mr. Jerry Howard addressed the Committee, thanking them for participating in the 2004 Arizona Archaeology Expo, hosted by the Mesa Southwest Museum.

Mr. Howard stated this was the largest Expo they've had so far, with 43 different groups presenting at the main Expo. Mr. Howard noted that didn't get the crowds they had hoped for, and they are looking at making some changes to increase attendance for future years.

Mr. Howard referred to the Tribune newspaper article on Pecos Road, noting that it was a really good article discussing the development encroachment issues.

Mr. Howard noted there was a newspaper article written about the Lewis Family, who showed up on Saturday morning for the Archaeology Expo. Mr. Howard reminded HPC members that it was the Lewis family (ancestors) pictured at the Mesa Grande site in the old photograph used on the Archaeology Awareness Month poster. The Lewis family informed Mr. Howard that the photo was taken in 1904. Mr. Howard said that a picture was taken of the present Lewis Family in front of the same site to commemorate the occasion.

Mr. Howard added there was another newspaper article written on the Pueblo Grand Mudslingers, the group that has been stabilizing the Pueblo Grande mound.

Mr. Howard stated that there may be another article written about human remains often being disturbed during construction, and a lot of property is being developed without archaeological surveys.

Mr. Howard updated the Committee on several other projects:

- The Verdugo stagecoach stop has had the entire roof replaced of the structure to look like the 1955 roof; the rest of the project is going well and nearing completion.
- A tall butte, which has petroglyphs and a hilltop fort, is being surveyed on the north side of the Salt River Reservation.
- The Southwest Museum met with Salt River Project concerning the Banner Hospital display room overlooking Mesa Grande, requesting funding from them. Mr. Howard noted they were very receptive to funding this project (up to \$25,000 with a written proposal). A proposal will be submitted. Southwest Ambulance will also provide funding.

12. Update Regarding Mesa Historical Museum from Tracy Wright Wagner.

Ms. Wright Wagner thanked the Historic Preservation Office and Committee members for their support of the Mesa Historical Museum's Heritage Funds grant application.

Ms. Wright Wagner distributed flyers detailing a living history presentation by Teresa Urrea to be held at the Mesa Historical Museum on April 26th.

Ms. Wright Wagner also informed Committee members about the final two speakers for the "Main Street and More" lecture series, beginning at 7 p.m. at the Mesa Historical Museum auditorium:

- April 15th, Sam Stapley will be talking about downtown Mesa in the 1930's.
- May 20th, Robert Brinton will discuss the history of tourism in Mesa.

13. Committee Member Comments and Questions and Future Agenda Items.

Chair Linoff mentioned that the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions (NAPC) is having their biannual conference in Indianapolis, July 15th – 18th, and noted it would be a very beneficial conference to attend.

Mr. Peters noted that the State Parks Department postponed the Buckhorn Baths National Register nomination another time. Mr. Peters stated he would make the required changes and resubmit the documentation.

14. Adjournment

8:39 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Gregory J. Marek, Historic Preservation Officer
Minutes prepared by Kathy Guthmiller