

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 7, 2012 DESIGN REVIEW MEETING

CITY OF MESA
MINUTES OF THE
DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
MARCH 7, 2012

A meeting of the Design Review Board was held in the Lower Level of the Council Chambers 57 East First Street, at 4:32 p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT

Craig Boswell - Chair
Dan Maldonado – Vice Chair
Scott Marble
Ralph Smith
Eric Paul

MEMBERS ABSENT

OTHERS PRESENT

John Wesley
Lesley Davis
Debbie Archuleta
Tom Ellsworth
Angelica Guevara
Wahid Alam
Jeff McVay
Dan Kauffman
Mark Dohrmann
Charles Huellmantel
Glen Blackmore
Vince DiBella
Others

- A. Discuss and Provide Direction Regarding Design Review cases:

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 7, 2012 DESIGN REVIEW MEETING

CASE: Verde Dimora Apartments
2217 North Power

REQUEST: Review of a 160 unit apartment complex

DISCUSSION:

Staffmember Lesley Davis explained the changes since the February meeting. The pre-school had been moved to the northwest corner of the site and had been reduced to a 2-story building. The broke up the roof line; added planters at the railings; added awnings; and provided elevations of the carports. The Architects Mark Dohrmann explained that by moving the pre-school they were able to address the Board's concerns regarding student drop-off. He also stated they had increased the size of the awnings and added awnings to the east and west elevations; provided walking trails; revised the roof line to have flat roofs where the buildings connect. Mr. Kaufman stated they had added a short screen wall along the south property line at the request of the adjacent charter school.

Chair Craig Boswell:

- Liked that the project was opened up more

Boardmember Dan Maldonado:

- The front door is lost
- Architecturally define the main entry
- Appreciate the colors
- The signs will be hard to see
- Re-visit the balcony plants
- Garden plots will be in retention, the wall could be a problem
- Maybe the wall could be a seat wall for the people working on the garden
- Provide decorative paving for pedestrian paths
- Is there a direct connection to the College?

Boardmember Ralph Smith:

- Location of pre-school is much better
- Likes the colors
- Concerned with heat gain at east and west
- The 3' awnings will only help after 10:00 a.m. and before 3:00 p.m.

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 7, 2012 DESIGN REVIEW MEETING

Boardmember Eric Paul:

- They are providing 10 parking spaces for the pre-school
- They plan to request no perimeter wall as part of the Planning and Zoning case
- Thought they were making an effort

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 7, 2012 DESIGN REVIEW MEETING

CASE: Residences at West Main
40 – 60 block of West Main

REQUEST: Review of a 5-story, 81 unit apartment project

DISCUSSION:

Charles Huelmantell explained the design theme had been taken from the Mesa Art Center. The building would be 5-stories with 81 units and the target market was active adult. The main entry was at the southwest corner. The amenities were all on the first floor, which would include bike storage, the management office, a gym, and a craft room. They stated they were working to put entries on Main, as requested by staff. They tried to isolate the parking, and repeat the paseo. They stated they would add architectural interest and color as they work on the plans. The project was designed to be viewed from the pedestrian scale.

Chair Craig Boswell:

- The units on the first floor are different from the rest of the project
- The patio area has glass doors so it can be enclosed
- They are working with the City to determine where the trash will be located, they want it inside the building in dumpsters
- He liked the way it is presented from Main Street
- Liked the articulation of the building
- The permeable pavers will be water harvesting area; which will help with grading and drainage and as well as watering the trees

Boardmember Dan Maldonado:

- Have they thought of retail on the first floor, or flex space?
- Hard to do with their financing
- They will design it so that it could become retail in the future
- The Main street frontage will be the gym, the office, etc. not residences
- Colors are cold; could the first floor be warmer?
- Is the paseo a fire lane?
- They plan to narrow the paseo, and enhance the buffer along the paseo
- Suggested a permeable surface on the paseo side

Boardmember Scott Marble:

- The two-tone colors don't really stand out
- Likes the color of the wood, it adds character
- Could they use more color?
- Because of the location and the light rail, the expectations are higher

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 7, 2012 DESIGN REVIEW MEETING

Boardmember Ralph Smith:

- EIFS and metal cladding will emulate and draw from the MAC
- Don't use exact same materials as the MAC
- Integrate the building so it isn't so boxy
- More shade elements on first floor
- Feels very dark
- Don't want it to be depressing
- At ground level you will need more than doors and landscaping
- First floor looks like vacant retail
- Shade will be very important

Boardmember Eric Paul:

- Ground face block columns come from the MAC
- Target market will be 62 and above
- For people who want to live in an urban area

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 7, 2012 DESIGN REVIEW MEETING

CASE: Culvers
1841 South Greenfield

REQUEST: Review of a 4,190 sq. ft. restaurant with 384 sq. ft. of outdoor seating

DISCUSSION:

Staffmember Lesley Davis explained the project and stated the stone would be larger and more colorful than the rest of the center.

Boardmember Dan Maldonado:

- The outdoor seating area would be chairs and umbrellas
- The landscaping is minimal, provide additional accents and plant types
- Group the plantings to create mass
- More foundation landscaping
- At the pedestrian sidewalk only landscape one side
- Provide more shade

Chair Craig Boswell:

- There will be a metal element on the canopy
- The awnings will be fabric
- Screen walls need to match the center

Boardmember Ralph Smith:

- New signage is definitely better
- Photos are much better than the elevations, line weights are bad, no 3-D quality
- Goose neck lights
- Will the EIFS have texture
- Concrete patio

Boardmember Eric Paul:

- Internal drainage
- Windows clear anodizes with white muntins
- Very limited outdoor seating
- Signage for drive-thru

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 7, 2012 DESIGN REVIEW MEETING

CASE: Chase Bank
9155 East Baseline

REQUEST: Review of a 3,895 sq. ft. bank

DISCUSSION:

Chair Craig Boswell stated this case was being continued to the April 4, 2012 meeting.

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 7, 2012 DESIGN REVIEW MEETING

CASE: Banner Health
NEC Crismon and Baseline

REQUEST: Review of 87,410 sq. ft. medical office buildings

DISCUSSION:

Staffmember Jeff McVay explained this would not be a hospital or an office. The building materials for the east and south elevations came from the Banner Gateway building. Staff felt the north elevations were very minimal, especially for 1A. He also explained there was a 404 wash that goes right through this site, which the applicant intends to channel. Staff was concerned with the channel design. The applicants explained the model for this was integrated doctors' offices, imaging, labs, all in the same building. There would be a single point of entry for the patients with central scheduling. There would be specialists, and pediatricians. It would be single shift, but urgent care, not overnight. This would be a new health care model, patient based wellness care. The lobby would wrap into Phase 1B. They explained the owner maintains the entire site. This portion of the 20± site would be 10.4 acres. This is a prototype building and Banner is not allowing much change.

Chair Craig Boswell:

- The Board was reviewing Phase 1A and 1B
- Provide more articulation and materials on north elevation

Boardmember Dan Maldonado:

- The design concept was striations in natural tones on cooler side to blend with zinc and EIFS, with glass to public areas
- The materials change where the fin walls are
- Light into exam areas where appropriate
- Suggested providing outdoor seating
- Landscaping is gridded but there are 5 or 6 species so that pulls it apart
- The landscaping doesn't line up with the windows and massing
- Use seat walls
- Don't put the outdoor seating right at the entry it is too busy
- May street tree theme for entry
- Front porch identity
- Create landscape pockets
- Provide architectural delineation entering from Baseline
- Enhance the patient entry driveways

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 7, 2012 DESIGN REVIEW MEETING

Boardmember Ralph Smith:

- Phase 1 lower element; 42' screen with 34' structure
- The shade structure comes down 5' in front of the windows
- Landscaping will shade in front of the building
- He wanted to see a detail of the window shade structure
- 24" is not far enough
- Liked the windows on the north side

Boardmember Eric Paul:

- Will not be more than 2 stories
- A lot of glass on west side
- A series of slats for shade
- Shade trees will be most effective
- North elevation seems like back of house
- Mix of materials, change of plain, more colors
- Could they use metal panels on phase 1A north elevation then they could be removed and used somewhere else?

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 7, 2012 DESIGN REVIEW MEETING

CASE: Eclectic Monkey Emporium
220 West Main

REQUEST: Review of a building mural

DISCUSSION:

Staffmember Angelica Guevara explained this was an existing building that was being repainted. The applicant, Glen Blackmore explained the West Mesa Board was giving a grant for the mural, and the Light Rail Committee was in favor of the mural. Mr. Blackmore stated there were only three other buildings like this; one in Paris, one in Barcelona, and the other in Las Vegas. He stated they would be painting the building to look like it was built in the 1900's, then make it look like it was sagging in the heat.

Chair Craig Boswell:

- Stucco physically painted.
- The colors come from Dana Point
- Liked the black and white elevation better than the color elevation
- Hope you can pull it off

Boardmember Dan Maldonado:

- The pole will be painted

Boardmember Ralph Smith:

- Would like the building to have texture
- Painting of awning on rear of building
- Concept is great, it will have to be really well done

Boardmember Eric Paul:

- Could they "melt" the canopy?
- Artist will have a maintenance contract on the building
- Artists have done murals in Prescott

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 7, 2012 DESIGN REVIEW MEETING

CASE: Ice Kiosk
South side of Main; east of Greenfield

REQUEST: Review of a 200 sq. ft. un-manned ice kiosk

DISCUSSION:

Staffmember Wahid Alam explained the project. Tim Highland explained there are 25 of these self-serve machines around Arizona. He stated this was the most they had done to revise the structure. He explained they wanted to use the discharge water to water the plants.

Boardmember Dan Maldonado:

- There can be a future drive through building behind this building?
- Suggested using raw milled steel
- Unique, appreciated the work they had done
- Concerned with how the door would work with the c-channels at the base
- Liked the site plan and landscaping
- Liked the pots

Boardmember Ralph Smith:

- Channels would be 10" with 2" between and 1-3/4" deep
- The material could be heavy
- There would be joints which would help
- Articulate the 4' panels
- SES to be on south side

Boardmember Eric Paul:

- They share the driveway with the Wendy's
- Concerned with the signage

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 7, 2012 DESIGN REVIEW MEETING

B. Call to Order:

Chair Craig Boswell called the meeting to order at 4:30 p.m.

C. Approval of the Minutes of the February 1, 2012 Meeting:

On a motion by Dan Maldonado seconded by Scott Marble the Board unanimously approved the minutes.

D. Design Review Cases:

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 7, 2012 DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

CASE #: DR12-06 Fiesta Police Station

LOCATION/ADDRESS: 1023 W. Grove Avenue (NWC Grove Ave and Westwood)
REQUEST: Approval of a 33,855 sq. ft. City of Mesa Police Substation
COUNCIL DISTRICT: District 3
OWNER: City of Mesa
APPLICANT: City of Mesa
ARCHITECT: Vince Di Bella, Saemisch & Di Bella Architects, Inc.
STAFF PLANNER: Jeffrey McVay, AICP

REQUEST: Approval of a 33,855 sq. ft. City of Mesa Police Station

SUMMARY: Staffmember Jeff McVay explained that he had added a condition of approval regarding landscape densities at the corner, and at the curved wall.

MOTION: It was moved by Ralph Smith and seconded by Dan Maldonado that DR12-06 be approved with the following conditions:

1. Compliance with the development as described in the Design Review Board staff report and as shown on the site plan, landscape plan, floor plans and exterior elevations.
2. Provision of an additional twelve (12), five (5) gallon size agave accents in the landscape area between the south building elevation and sidewalk.
3. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.
4. Compliance with all requirements of the Development Services, Engineering, Transportation, and Solid Waste Departments.
5. All backflow preventers 2" or larger shall be screened with landscape material located within a 6' radius of the backflow preventer. All backflow preventers less than 2" shall be placed in a wire mesh basket *and painted green*.
6. Fire risers, building downspouts and roof access ladders are to be located within the building.

VOTE: Passed 5 – 0

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 7, 2012 DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

E. Other business:

Selection of representative for the General Plan update

Staffmember Gordon Sheffield explained that the City would be updating the General Plan and he asked for a member of the Board to be on the Update Committee.

F. Adjournment:

Respectfully submitted,

Debbie Archuleta
Planning Assistant

da