

CITY OF MESA

MINUTES OF THE PLANNING AND ZONING BOARD MEETING

Held in the City of Mesa Council Chambers

Date: March 21, 2012 Time: 4:00 p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT

Randy Carter, Chair
Beth Coons, Vice-Chair
Lisa Hudson
Brad Arnett
Suzanne Johnson

MEMBERS ABSENT

Chell Roberts
Vince DiBella (excused)

OTHERS PRESENT

John Wesley
Gordon Sheffield
Tom Ellsworth
Lesley Davis
Angelica Guevara
Wahid Alam
Debbie Archuleta

Chairperson Carter declared a quorum present and the meeting was called to order at 4:00 p.m. The meeting was recorded on tape and dated March 21, 2012. Before adjournment at 5:25 p.m., action was taken on the following:

It was moved by Boardmember Beth Coons, seconded by Boardmember Brad Arnett that the minutes of the February 14, 2012, and February 15, 2012 study sessions and regular meeting be approved as submitted. Vote: 5 – 0.

Consent Agenda Items: All items identified with an asterisk (*) were approved with one Board motion.

It was moved by Boardmember Suzanne Johnson, seconded by Boardmember Lisa Hudson that the consent items be approved. Vote: 5 – 0 (Boardmembers Roberts and DiBella absent)

Zoning Cases: Z12-02, Z12-11, Z12-12, Z12-13

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 21, 2012 PLANNING AND ZONING MEETING

Item: **Z12-02** 6859 East Rembrandt Avenue. Located north of Warner Road and east of Power Road (14,100± sf). District 6. Council Use Permit. This request will continue to allow an existing charter school within an industrial zoned area. (PLN2011-00375) Daniel Deryke, Western Horizons Development LLC, owner; Steven Mills, University Public Schools, applicant. **(District 6)**

Comments: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed individually

It was moved by Boardmember Suzanne Johnson, seconded by Boardmember Lisa Hudson

That: The Board continue zoning case Z12-02 to April 18, 2012

Vote: Passed 5 – 0 (Boardmembers Roberts and DiBella absent)

* * * * *

Note: Audiotapes of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also “live broadcasted” through the City of Mesa’s website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 21, 2012 PLANNING AND ZONING MEETING

Item: **Z12-11 (District 5)** 2217 North Power Road. Located north of McKellips Road on the east side of Power Road (5.34± acres). District 5. Rezone from RS-35 to RM-4 BIZ and Site Plan Review. This request will allow the development of a 160 unit apartment complex. (PLN2012-00010) owner; Dan Kauffman, applicant

Comments: Boardmember Bran Arnett abstained.

Dan Kauffman represented the case and explained there are 1,600 jobs at the corner of Power and McKellips; the MCC campus is directly east of the site, and there is bus accessibility. He stated Salt River Project would be partnering with him as a test program. There will be bikes available for tenants to use. Mr. Kauffman stated the pre-school was proposed by MCC, so their students could use the pre-school as well as work there. He stated the project would have a veteran's center; recycling rooms on every floor; an electric vehicle charging station; and community gardens. The buildings were designed so there would be natural light in the hallways, and have built in desks and storage. The carports would be solar panels. Mr. Kauffman stated the project is next to transit to encourage bus use. There are 51 retail uses within walking distance of the project.

Mr. Kauffman stated he had researched other cities' parking requirements and found that Scottsdale had recently changed their requirement for apartments to 1.5 parking spaces per unit overall. This project had 160 units and 198 parking spaces. He stated the average vacancy rate for apartments in the Valley is 12.35%. He stated the complex would be providing education and training on energy conservation. He stated that according to a study, apartments generate fewer calls for Police and Fire than single family homes.

Staffmember Lesley Davis explained the request. She stated the project density was 29 units per acre. The parking was proposed at 1.2 spaces per unit. She stated the applicant had met with the Design Review Board twice and was continuing to work with staff on a few issues. Staffmember Davis had spoken with the Transportation Department and they had assured her Power Road can handle the traffic that would be generated by this project. The project was compatible with the General Plan designation which was HDR 15+.

Merrilou Peek of 6526 East Holly spoke in opposition. She stated she had lived in her house for 13 years and the neighborhood is older than that. This type of project would change the dynamic of the neighborhood. She was concerned crime rates would go up with 200 new neighbors, all young. She wanted the case postponed so that the neighbors could circulate a petition.

Nancy Montani of 2453 North Ramada spoke in opposition. She was concerned with the parking and the three-story buildings. She stated Sedona takes aesthetics into account. She was concerned about traffic. She stated the pre-school parents can't go left to go south on Power Road. She also stated there is already a problem with people making u-turns at Hermosa Vista.

Wendy Mathews of 6531 East Holly spoke in opposition. She was opposed to the density. She stated she chose her home because of the zoning around them. She stated tenants would own cars. She stated Mr. Kauffman identified jobs, but they are low paying retail jobs, and tenants would be taking away the jobs she wants and their kids need. She stated sub-meters were fluff. She stated the area did not need additional pre-schools. College students will have parties.

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 21, 2012 PLANNING AND ZONING MEETING

Albert Schaff of 2452 N Rugby spoke in opposition. He stated he had lived in his home for 16 years. This was a single family area with lots of wide open spaces. There were no 3-story buildings in the area. Low cost for students. Younger people would mean crime. He was concerned that the project was next to a high school. He stated traffic congestion from Hermosa Vista was already bad. He stated there were 7 pre-schools within one mile of this site. He understood there are veterans coming home.

Bob Carufel 6532 East Rustic Drive spoke in opposition. He stated Mr. Kauffman is a business man. He was sure Mr. Kauffman had thought this out thoroughly on paper. Traffic is a real issue. The amount of parking spaces was a concern, what about visitors? He stated RS-35 was comparable to surrounding homes why can't single-family homes be built. He stated people would have cars. Safeway is too far to walk to for groceries.

Darek Andrusol of 2431 North Rugby was opposed to the project but did not wish to speak.

Suzanne Rassi of AZ Agribusiness and Equine Charter School 2165 North Power spoke in opposition. She stated there were 300 students at the charter school who have to turn right onto Power Road. She was opposed to college students next to high school students.

Philip Carpenter of 1351 West Cardinal Way, Chandler spoke regarding the project. Mr. Carpenter represented Arizonans Concerned About Smoking. He stated the Maricopa Community College District would be going smoke free soon. He thought this project should protect tenants by being a smoke free complex.

Bill Montani of 2453 North Ramada was opposed to the project but did not wish to speak.

In response to the neighbor's concerns Mr. Kauffman reiterated that a study had shown apartments have fewer crime calls than single-family homes. The height of the buildings would be 37'4" to top of peak. He stated students would want to work. This would not be a dormitory. There would be locked entrance gates to the buildings. He stated tenants may not walk to Safeway; however, they could buy groceries at Target. He liked the idea of being a smoke free complex.

Boardmember Suzanne Johnson confirmed the current bus stop was at McKellips, the proposed bus stop in front of the project would be installed when the project was complete. She confirmed they have someone to run the pre-school. The current HDR15+ in the General Plan was adopted in 2002. She stated there were a lot of aspects that she liked, such as the green living and working with Salt River Project. She stated the density and height were not an issue for her; however the project needed more parking. She confirmed that to get to a 1.5 ratio would require an additional 32 parking spaces. She liked the concept.

Boardmember Beth Coons confirmed the 1.2 parking ratio was not based on the vacancy rate. Staff was basing that on the number of units total. She confirmed the solar panels would be installed at the time of construction and parking stalls would be assigned. She confirmed many of the charter the school students drive and the school has approximately 120 parking stalls. She asked if Transportation had done studies regarding a signal at the entrance to the college. She appreciated the bikes, but she had concerns regarding parking. She was also concerned that the project had not completed their Design Review process. She was concerned with people making u-turns on Power. She confirmed the Zoning Code requires 2.1 parking spaces for apartments.

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 21, 2012 PLANNING AND ZONING MEETING

Chair Randy Carter stated this project has all the future thinking we hope to see for projects in the future. He asked the applicant if he thought he could work with the neighbors if the case was continued. Mr. Kauffman stated he would prefer a vote, not a continuance. Mr. Kauffman stated if he didn't make the project sustainable it would be just another apartment project. Mr. Carter suggested making the garden plot and 25' landscape buffer smaller in order to provide additional parking along the south. Staffmember Lesley Davis stated the landscape buffer along the south was also retention. Mr. Carter suggested additional parking along the east or possibly removing some of the landscape islands to add parking.

It was moved by Boardmember Suzanne Johnson, seconded by Boardmember

That: The Board recommend to the City Council approval of zoning case Z12-11 with an additional condition that the project meet a parking ratio of 1.5

The motion failed for lack of a second

It was moved by Boardmember Beth Coons, seconded by Boardmember Suzanne Johnson

That: The Board recommend to the City Council denial of zoning case Z12-11

Vote: Passed 4 – 0 (Boardmembers Roberts and DiBella were absent) (Boardmember Arnett abstained)

* * * * *

Note: Audiotapes of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also "live broadcasted" through the City of Mesa's website at www.mesaaz.gov

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 21, 2012 PLANNING AND ZONING MEETING

Item: **Z12-12 (District 3)** 2254 West Main Street. Located west of Dobson Road on the north side of Main Street (3± acres). District 3. Rezone from GC CUP and RM-4 CUP to GC CUP BIZ and RM-4 CUP BIZ and Site Plan Review. This request will allow the development of a mixed use apartment complex with first floor commercial space. (PLN2012-00037) A New Leaf, owner; Doug McCord, applicant.

Comments: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed individually

It was moved by Boardmember Suzanne Johnson, seconded by Boardmember Lisa Hudson

That: The Board recommend to the City Council approval of zoning case Z12-12 conditioned upon:

1. Compliance with the basic development as described in the project narrative and as shown on the site plan submitted.
2. Compliance with all requirements of staff Design Review.
3. Compliance with all City development codes and regulations.

Vote: Passed 5 – 0 (Boardmembers Roberts and DiBella absent)

* * * * *

Note: *Audiotapes of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also “live broadcasted” through the City of Mesa’s website at www.mesaaz.gov*

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 21, 2012 PLANNING AND ZONING MEETING

Item: **Z12-13 (District 4)** The 40 to the 60 block of East Main Street (north side). Located east of Center Street on the north side of Main Street (1.25± acres). District 4. Site Plan Review. This request will allow a multi-residential development.

Comments: This case was on the consent agenda and therefore was not discussed individually

It was moved by Boardmember Suzanne Johnson, seconded by Boardmember Lisa Hudson

That: The Board continue zoning case Z12-13 to April 18, 2012

Vote: Passed 5 – 0 (Boardmembers Roberts and DiBella absent)

* * * * *

Note: *Audiotapes of the Planning & Zoning Board Meetings are available in the Planning Division Office for review. They are also “live broadcasted” through the City of Mesa’s website at www.mesaaz.gov*

MINUTES OF THE MARCH 21, 2012 PLANNING AND ZONING MEETING

Respectfully submitted,

John Wesley, Secretary
Planning Director

DA:
I:\P&Z\12\Minutes\3-21-12.doc