



Design Review Board

**Tuesday, September 10, 2019
Council Chambers – Lower Level
57 East 1st Street
4:30 PM**

A work session of the Design Review Board was held at the City of Mesa Council Chamber – Lower Level, 57 East 1st Street at 4:30 p.m.

Board Members Present:

Vice Chair Scott Thomas
Boardmember Sean Banda
Boardmember Nicole Posten-Thompson
Boardmember J. Seth Placko
Boardmember Jeanette Knudsen
Boardmember Tanner Green

Board Members Absent:

Chair Randy Carter

Staff Present:

Nana Appiah, PhD, AICP, Planning Director
Tom Ellsworth, Principal Planner
Lesley Davis, Senior Planner
Heather Omta, Planning Assistant
Wahid Alam, AICP, Planner II
Ryan McCann, Planner I

Others Present:

Jen Duff, Council Member, District 4
Jeff McVay, Downtown Transformation Manager
Angelica Guevara, Project Manager

Vice Chair Scott Thomas welcomed everyone to the Work Session at 4:30 p.m.

Items A.1., A.2. and A.3 were discussed as a group.

Item A.1.

DRB17-00114

Location: 41 West Main Street

Request: Review of façade improvement

Applicant: City of Mesa

Staff Planner: Angelica Guevara, Project Manager

Council District: 4

Item A.2.

DRB17-00115

Location: 45 West Main Street

Request: Review of façade improvement

Applicant: City of Mesa

Staff Planner: Angelica Guevara

Council District: 4

Item A.3.

DRB17-00116

Location: 47 West Main Street

Request: Review of façade improvement

Applicant: City of Mesa

Staff Planner: Angelica Guevara

Council District: 4

Angelica Guevara, City of Mesa Project Manager, presented the three cases for proposed façade improvements for 41, 45 and 47 East Main Street. (DRB17-00114, DRB17-00115, DRB17-00116). She explained these improvements were for the front of three buildings along Main street that are behind the existing colonnade. This proposal is to remove the colonnade and reface the buildings behind to create a more attractive street presence from Main Street. She explained that a similar proposal had been before the Board in 2017, but they needed to revise that plan. She explained that the bids came in higher than expected, so they had to revisit the proposal. The purpose is to remove the colonnades, repair cornice, provide shades, and provide store front improvements with lighting.

Jeff McVay, City of Mesa Downtown Transformation Manger, explained that all canopies are metal. He stated that the existing colonnade is heavy and disconnected architecturally. The goal is to make it more inviting to patrons by lifting the facades and exposing the front of the existing buildings. He said the brick cannot be salvaged on Le Studio. He also explained that Community development Block Grant (CDBG) dollars were being utilized for this project so there is only so much money available. They are creating a street scape design concept.

The project architect, Vince DiBella with Adaptive Architects, stated the cornice over the three storefronts is the one historical piece they are trying to save. He said that at 41 We Main, the canopy is designed to add a deck in the future.

- ❖ Vice Chair Thomas:
 - Asked if canopy material is standing seams or corrugated. Doesn't recommend a flat metal canopy.
 - Suggested that the metal all have ribs, some have more protrusion than others for variation and depth.

- ❖ Boardmember Banda:
 - Doesn't feel that applying applique is doing justice to the wall over Le Studio Salon
 - Not seeing a break in the suites, they look connected
 - Middle studio is over simplified
 - Not in favor of the changes as proposed
 - Design doesn't feel complete or like a significant upgrade
 - Tile doesn't feel like a full renovation
 - Missing a fun or whimsy look, lacks character
 - The 2017 design had more detail
 - Likes the three individual canopies over Le Studio
 - Pergola needs dimension, liked deck railing in 2017 design
 - LED lighting should be between 3-4K Kelvin

- ❖ Boardmember Posten-Thompson:
 - Doesn't care for the canopies broken into three over Le Studios
 - Asked if the planters would be installed and received confirmation from Mr. McVay that CDBG funds cannot fund the planters
 - Return patio railing to pergola for aesthetics and interest

- ❖ Boardmember Knudsen:
 - Le Studio, wants all three of the canopies the same color
 - Consider a change in the color of the canopy over Milano's, maybe grey.
 - Suggested all three canopies be the bronze color on Le Studio, and Milano canopy be silver/grey

- ❖ Boardmember Green:
 - Colors and canopies make it look like one building, design doesn't differentiate each suite
 - Play with the geometry, it seems very squared up
 - Play with visual interest if color changes are not an option

Item A.4.

DRB19-00233

Location: Within the 8300 block of East Baseline Road

Request: Review of a group commercial center for multiple buildings

Applicant: RCAA Architects

Staff Planner: Wahid Alam

Council District: 6

Continued to October 8, 2019 meeting.

Item A.5.

DRB19-00521

Location: 7353 East Ray Road

Request: Review of new commercial building

Applicant: Balmer Architectural Group, Inc.,

Staff Planner: Ryan McCann

Council District: 6

Ryan McCann, staff planner, presented case. He explained that the site is currently vacant site. The proposal is for a 48,000 square-foot office, warehouse. They are only developing the west portion of the parcel.

Applicant, Wes Balmer, stated that the rust color (P4) changed to yellow. He said they are proposing yellow metal accents. There will be some up lighting on the center mass and soffit lighting for the rest. The mass at the end of the building was designed to create a break in the roofline for interest.

❖ Vice Chair Thomas:

- Would like to see variation up and down
- Looks monotoned
- Everything looks similar along Ray Road, very industrial
- Prefers to see more variation in design around the airport

Planning Director, Nana Appiah, addressed Vice Chair Thomas' question about Design Guidelines around the airport and getting some variation in design. He let the board know that staff will have a Quality Design Guideline Update presentation at the next meeting and explained that staff will be looking for the board's input.

❖ Boardmember Posten-Thompson:

- Bring up masses on end of the building
- Likes the pop of color

❖ Boardmember Knudsen:

- Accent color is striking
- Likes the yellow instead of the rust

❖ Boardmember Banda:

- Likes the in and out
- Likes the pop of color but not a fan of yellow
- Emphasize color variations
- Add accent lighting
- Striking lighting on center column

❖ Boardmember Green:

- Likes the pop of color
- Likes the architecture
- Central mass shifts from one side to another on renderings. Please review.

Item A.6.

DRB19-00556

Location: 9125 East Guadalupe Road

Request: Review of a retail tire sales and repair facility

Applicant: Neil Feaser, RKAA Architects, Inc

Staff Planner: Wahid Alam

Council District: 6

Wahid Alam, Staff Planner, presented case for a new commercial building.

Applicant Neil Feaser, RKAA Architects, Inc., represented the project.

Michael Corso submitted a card to speak to the board. He is the property owner for the storage facility at 9057 E Guadalupe Road. He stated that he supports the project and worked with the applicant to achieve continuous architecture with his adjacent storage facility.

- ❖ Vice Chair Thomas:
 - How much do the roll up doors project? Applicant clarified roll up door projects two to three feet.

- ❖ Boardmember Banda:
 - Likes the building
 - Could create more texture
 - North side doesn't have the same appeal
 - Just stucco on stucco
 - Dress up the corner
 - Entry needs attention

- ❖ Boardmember Posten-Thompson:
 - Doesn't care for the green screen
 - Likes the glass door
 - Underwhelmed by entry and north elevation
 - Overwhelmingly grey
 - A lot of stucco
 - No significant shadow lines

- ❖ Boardmember Knudsen:
 - Likes the continuation of the lines in the windows and doors
 - Not Opposed to the red pop of color
 - Likes the placement of the coloring
 - South side is very plain

- ❖ Boardmember Green:
 - Improve north elevation design
 - Entrance is lost
 - Add more visual interest for the north side

Item A.7.

DRB19-00570

Location: 8946 East Germann Road

Request: Review of new retail shopping center

Applicant: Navarro Design

Staff Planner: Ryan McCann

Council District: 6

Ryan McCann, staff planner, presented a proposed new commercial building intended for retail and restaurant use. He stated that the building is approximately 10,000 square-feet. The south side of the building is highly visible from Germann Road and the surrounding site is mostly undeveloped, but the board had approved a building to the north of the proposed building. Mr. McCann explained that the Queen Creek Irrigation District will only allow decomposed granite in the easement along Germann Road. Staff is looking for direction from the board on enhancements to the south elevation design.

Applicant, Hector Navarro for Navarro Design represented the project. He explained that the south elevation has pops out that go out about 2-feet and the canopies also pop out. The building will have the potential to accommodate 6 tenants and the end units could have patios.

❖ Vice Chair Thomas:

- Clarified pop out of 4 inches on south side rendering. Rendering shows a large shadow.
- Tends to look linear
- Maybe pitch the roof

❖ Boardmember Green:

- Wants to something more than just a stucco wall facing Germann Road
- The end caps (east and west side) feel extremely large
- The ends feel like drive-thru's
- Mass is little overwhelming
- Looks like a professional building rather than retail

❖ Boardmember Posten-Thompson:

- Doesn't look like retail
- Suggested they think about end tenant needs
- Doesn't mind the color or material
- Back needs more architecture facing atrial street
- Looks like a one or two tenant building

❖ Boardmember Banda:

- Short and heavy
- Too much of the same kind of elevation
- Doesn't mind the materials
- Looks like office space not retail
- Tie in landscaping
- The arcade feels heavy
- Seems like a lot of concrete
- Mix materials
- Define the space better

A. Call to Order 5:44pm

B. Consider the Minutes from the 8/13/2019 meeting

Boardmember Posten-Thompson moved to approve August's meeting minutes, board votes all in favor.

C. Discuss and take action on the following Design Review case: None

D. Other Business: None

E. Adjournment

Boardmember Posten-Thompson moved to adjourn the meeting and Boardmember Banda seconded. The session concluded at 5:46pm.

The City of Mesa is committed to making its public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. For special accommodations, please contact the City Manager's Office at (480) 644- 3333 or AzRelay 7-1-1 at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting. **Si necesita asistencia o traducción en español, favor de llamar al menos 48 horas antes de la reunión al 480-644- 2767.**