

City of Mesa

MINUTES OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMITTEE

Date: December 14, 2006 **Time:** 6:00 p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT	STAFF PRESENT	OTHERS PRESENT
Ron Peters Barbara Jarrett Lane Burdick Nathan Ricks	Stephanie Brüning	Lozetta Blake Jerry Dorsett Charles O’Conguo Ethel Raglin Kyle McCain
MEMBERS ABSENT	SUPPORT PRESENT	
Lillian Wilkinson Steve McCance Jared Smith	Anna Camino	

1. Call to Order

The December 14, 2006 Regular Meeting of the Historic Preservation Committee (HPC) was called to order at 6:05 pm.

Let the Record show that we have Quorum

2. Consider Minutes of August 22, 2006, and October 12, 2006, Regular Meeting

Motion: Mrs. Jarrett moved to approve the meeting minutes from the August 22, 2006 HPC.

Seconded: Mr. Burdick

Vote: Unanimous (4 – 0)

Motion: Mrs. Jarrett moved to approve the meeting minutes from the October 12, 2006 HPC.

Seconded: Mr. Burdick

Vote: Unanimous (4 – 0)

3. Discuss and Consider: Historic Clearance-Work conducted without a clearance at 105 North Pasadena (Glenwood Wilbur Historic District). Applicant was not present at October 12, 2006, meeting and asked to address the HPC. The HPC decision was to concur with recommendations.

The HPC voted on this item at the October 12, 2006 meeting and approved Staff’s recommendations. The owner was not able to be present at that meeting but he, Mr. Jerry Dorsett, is present this evening.

This property is a contributing structure in the Wilbur Historic District.

The HPC suggested to the owner that he should meet with the Historic Preservation Planner to review other options that might be available.

Work to the back of the house is okay to remain, per the HP Planner.

Mr. Dorsett, the original owner, has made the changes to the property to improve the property, and to meet Fire Code standards and other safety concerns.

Discussion item; no vote necessary. The HPC upheld their decision from the October 12, 2006 HPC Meeting (approve Staff recommendations).

4. Discuss and Consider Historic Clearance – Work conducted without a clearance at 215 North LeBaron (Robson Historic District)

The property is a contributing structure in the Robson Historic District.

A demolition on the property was started prior to a permit being obtained.

Plans have been submitted for replacement of addition; carport is not being replaced at this time. The air conditioner will be placed on the ground.

Recommendations:

1. Staff recommends that the HPC determine that the removal of the carport and rear addition does not adversely affect the historic significance of the property and approves the Historic Clearance Demolition application.

(* If the demolition clearance is granted, the Office of Historic Preservation will review the historic clearance request for renovations to the property for compliance with the Secretary of Interior Standards.)

Motion: Mr. Burdick motioned to approve Staff's recommendations.

Seconded: Mr. Ricks seconded the motion.

Vote: Unanimous (4 – 0)

5. Discuss and Consider: Historic Clearance – Work conducted without a clearance at 463 North Grand (Evergreen Historic District)

The property is a contributing structure in the Evergreen Historic District.

Discussion:

The HPC asked if the block had been prepped for stucco. The reply from the owner was that it had been prepped and a bonding adhesive was applied, then a stucco brown coat was added. The stucco coat was added in all places, therefore, the original material cannot be shown (for historical purposes).

Recommendations:

The addition of a stucco finish to the original cement brick finish was begun without a historic clearance.

According to the SoIS, the removal and alteration of historic materials is to be avoided; distinctive finishes and construction techniques that characterize a property shall be preserved; deteriorated historic features are to be repaired and not replaced and where replacement is needed it should match the original; and exterior alterations shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property.

Staff recommends that although the work may not meet the SoIS for a historic clearance that the HPC determine that because the removal process will damage the original cement brick and that the costs of removal are substantial that the work must remain because it is not reversible. However, a notification letter should be sent to the SHPO to determine whether or not the house will continue to be considered a contributing structure in the neighborhood.

Motion: Mrs. Jarrett motioned to approve Staff's recommendations.

Seconded: Mr. Burdick seconded the motion.

Vote: Unanimous (4 – 0)

6. Discuss and Consider: Amendment to the City of Mesa Zoning Ordinance, Sections 11-4-3(D) and Section 11-5-4(A) relating to Office Use in Level 1 Historic Structures.

Background: A historical survey was conducted in 1984, which designated several properties as Level One Historic Structures. Since 1984, there have been two Ordinances passed that dealt with all the historic resources in the Town Center that allows a Special Use Permit (SUP) as an option for offices in the Level One Historic structures. The 1984 survey designated forty-two (42) buildings as Level One Historic Structures with 35 being allowed the opportunity to apply for a Special Use Permit, but the remaining seven (7) properties were left out of the two Ordinances. This proposed Ordinance is moving forward to allow those 7 properties to have the same opportunity as the other 35 properties. An application for a Special Use Permit is still required on all the properties.

The purpose of the proposed Ordinance is to allow professional and general office sites in a Level One Historic Structure, subject to approval of a SUP.

The proposed Ordinance does not guarantee approval of a SUP for an office use; rather, it grants the property owner the right to apply for a SUP.

This proposed Ordinance has been approved by the Downtown Development Committee (by a vote of 5-0), and the Planning and Zoning Board (by a vote of 4-0).

Discussion:

The HPC heard from several citizens who were in attendance that were concerned about how the Ordinance, if approved, would affect the residential status of the neighborhoods. Many of the residents that spoke want the neighborhoods to remain residential, and not turn into a business district.

The citizens were reassured that this proposed Ordinance will only give the property owners of the 7 properties noted in the proposed Ordinance the right to apply for a Special Use Permit but there are no guarantees that a SUP would be granted. Guidelines still need to be met before a permit will even be considered, including that the business would be compatible to the land uses around it.

There are several protections built-in to this Ordinance.

Motion: Mr. Ricks motioned to recommend approval to the City Council in regards to the amendment to the City of Mesa Zoning Ordinance, Sections 11-4-3(D) and Section 11-5-4(A) relating to Office Use in Level 1 Historic Structures.

Seconded: Mrs. Jarrett seconded the motion.

Vote: Passed (3 – 1)

7. Discuss and Consider the adoption of a resolution for establishing guidelines for office uses in a Level 1 Historic Structure.

The HPC discussed the guidelines listed on page 3 of the Historic Preservation Committee Report dated December 14, 2006.

Motion: Mrs. Jarrett made the motion to adopt the Guidelines for Office Uses in a Level One Historic Structure as listed on page 3 of the HPC Report dated December 14, 2006.

Seconded: Mr. Ricks

Vote: Unanimous (4 – 0)

8. Update: Mesa Southwest Museum and Mesa Historical Museum

Mesa Southwest Museum – The “Paradise Lost – Arizona South of the Ice” exhibit will be opening in January 2007. Included in this exhibit will be the recent discovered Gilbert Mammoth.

The exhibit on Mesa’s History has been moved from the Southwest Museum to the Mesa Historical Museum permanently.

9. Project Status Report: December 2006

A copy of the Project Status Report was distributed in all Committee members’ packets. A summary of the report:

- Clark West Side Addition Historic District is awaiting the draft report.
- Post War II study has been put on hold
- Fraser Field National Register is awaiting the consultant’s response to address the comments made by Staff.
- Adaptive Reuse of the Dr. Alston House: The Level One Ordinance was passed by the DDC and the P and Z, and staff plans to go before City Council in January.
- 1912 Steam Locomotive in Pioneer Park:
 - The Arizona Railway Museum in Chandler is still interested in purchasing the locomotive.
 - Parks and Recreation has no funding. If no options are found, they will seek to sell the locomotive.
- The Demolition Clearance for 2222 E. Lehi has been issued.

10. Committee Member Comments, Questions, and Future Agenda Items

None.

11. Items from Citizens present

No items from citizens.

12. Historic Preservation Planner Report

- When the Fraser Field Historic District applied for the local zoning, the pamphlets they received stated that they did not have to follow any guidelines. Ms. Brüning is following up on that item.

- An owner of a Bungalow house in the Evergreen District phoned Ms. Brüning regarding a historical mailbox that is on her property. While doing renovations to the front porch, the owner removed the historic mailbox but still has the mail slot in the front door. The U.S. Post Office told her that she cannot move her mailbox and are now not delivering her mail. Ms. Brüning will be composing a letter to the U.S. Post Office explaining the National Register Significance Historic Mailbox usage. The HPC will support the HP Planner.
- Discussion regarding the recent passing of Proposition 207. The proposition will now require 100% signatures in order to place any zoning (i.e., Historic Zoning District). Currently, City of Mesa has a 50% + 1 to move forward with zoning items.
 - This is a concern for many.
 - This may hinder any new Historic Preservation Districts to be zoned in the near future.

13. Adjournment at 7:40 pm